



**Comment and Review to the
Request for Proposal RMA-2020-006
Waterworks Equipment with Related Accessories and Services**

The following RFP solicitation notices were posted online on the recognized bidding portals across Canada listed below.

- <http://bcbid.gov.ca>
- www.purchasingconnection.ca
- <http://www.sasktenders.ca>
- <http://www.merx.com>
- <https://www.princeedwardisland.ca/en/tenders>
- <https://procurement.novascotia.ca/>

The proposal submission deadline was extended via the January 7, 2021 addendum from January 13, 2021 to January 21, 2021 at 3:00pm MT. The tender documents were retrieved from Alberta Purchasing Connection (APC) 78 times and the following proponents provided their response before the deadline.

BBA Pumps	Computrol	eleven-x	EMCO Waterworks
Iconix	Johlin Measurement	New Tech Solids	Pond Pro Canada
SEGO			

The proposals were evaluated were completed by February 19, 2021 by the following individuals.

Dave Dextraze, Manager of Vendor Relations - RMA

Jesse Patenaude, Manager of National Partnerships - RMA

Tyler Hannemann, Manager of Business Development - RMA

Nigel Gamester, Vendor Administration Manager - RMA



Per the Request for Proposal (RFP) documentation, proposals were evaluated in two stages; the first stage is the pass / fail evaluation of all mandatory requirements and second stage is the assignment of material points based on the rated elements / pricing elements of the proponent's proposal. There is a minimum score of 65% required to pass the second stage of evaluation.

The proposal evaluation committee used the evaluation criteria outlined in the RFP document and determined that 4 of the 9 responses did not pass the mandatory requirement stage. **New Tech Solids** was unsuccessful in all 6 mandatory requirement elements. **BBA Pumps** did not provide authorized signatures where required and omitted the workers compensation clearance certificate. **SEGO** also did not provide authorized signatures on the forms necessary and omitted returning forms D&E within their proposal. In addition, there was no documents of authority provided with their submission. **Pro Pond Canada** omitted Form E and its required signature as well as the required documents of authority.

For the 5 responses that passed the mandatory requirements, each were assigned material points based on the rated elements and pricing/discount criteria per the evaluation matrix outlined within the RFP document. **Johlin Measurement** scored a total of 651 points where the strongest elements of the proposal were found in the corporate overview and pricing elements. The areas of weakness with this proposal are experience related and the proposed marketing approach and plan. **Eleven-x** scored a total of 732.25 points and offered a strong proposal focused on technology solutions for water management. The marketing approach and plan was another strong element of this proposal. The area of weakness with this proposal is the member pricing and the requirement for upfront payment prior to delivery. **Computrol** scored a total of 732.5 points and offered a strong proposal focused on technology solutions for water management. Proposed pricing is one of the key strengths to this proposal, however the proposed marketing approach and plan is the most notable weakness to this proposal. **EMCO** scored a total of 843 points and offered a strong proposal including their full waterworks catalogue. All elements of the proposal scored high material points, with the only substandard element isolated to their electronic billing capabilities. **Iconix** scored a total of 885 points and offered a strong proposal including their full catalogue. All elements of the proposal scored high material points, with this proposal offering the lowest price to RMA members.

Based on the complete RFP evaluation methodology summarized in this report, RMA vendor relations is offering contract award notices to Iconix, EMCO, Computrol, and Eleven-x.


A large, bold, black handwritten signature that appears to read "Nigel Gamester". The signature is written over a horizontal line.

Nigel Gamester, BComm

Vendor Administration Manager



Exhibit A – Combined Proposal Evaluations

		Proposal Evaluation Waterworks Equipment and Related Accessories RMA-2020-006											
		Iconix	EMCO	Computrol	Eleven-x	Johlin	SEGO	Pond Pro Canada	New Tech Solids	BBA Pumps			
Available Points													
Labelled Electronic Submission	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail
Proposal Format and Content	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail	Pass
Authorized Signature	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Fail	Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail
Proof of Insurance - 5M	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail	Fail	Pass
Workers Compensation Clearance Certificate	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail
Documents of Authority	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail	Fail	Pass
Part A - Corporate Overview (100)													
Corporate Overview	60	55.75	58.25	52.5	48.75	50							
Legal Actions	20	20	20	20	20	20							
Financial Strength	20	17.75	18	17.25	15.25	14							
Part B - Experience & Qualifications (100)													
Proponent Experience	50	49	46.5	40.5	46.25	25							
Personnel	30	29.5	29	17.5	25	15							
Workplace Safety	20	20	16.5	7.5	6.75	5							
Part C - Goods/Services Description (650)													
Functional Requirement - Range of Products	100	82.5	96.25	48.75	48.75	65							
Functional Requirement - Pricing & Discounts	300	297.5	273.75	255	206.25	250							
1. Same as offered individual entity	0	-	-	-	-	-							
2. Same as offered to GPO's, co-operative procurement organizations	20	-	20	-	-	20							
3. Better than offered to GPO's, co-operative procurement organizations	50	50	-	50	50	-							
Functional Requirement - Administrative Fee	20	12.5	20	10	15.25	20							
Functional Requirement - Product Delivery & Shipping Considerations	100	73.75	81.25	62.5	70	60							
Functional Requirement - Product Availability	50	33.75	49.75	25	32.5	20							
Technical Requirements - Electronic Billing Considerations	30	15	7.5	20	15.75	10							
Part D - Approach & Marketing Plan (150)													
Proposed Approach	20	16.75	13.75	9.75	18	12							
Proposed Marketing Plan	130	111.25	92.5	96.25	113.75	65							
Total Points /1000		885	843	732.5	732.25	651	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A